

Plaintiffs' Exhibit JJ

Student A

VIDEO TELECONFERENCE DEPOSITION
[REDACTED]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

SIERRA BOUCHER, LILY ENGBRECHT,
NATASSIA TUHOVAK, HANNAH WHELAN, and
CASSIDY WOOD,

Plaintiffs,

- against -

Case No.
1:22-cv-00381-CCR

TRUSTEES OF CANISIUS COLLEGE,

Defendant.

Video teleconference deposition of [REDACTED]
[REDACTED], present at 151 Washington Highway, Amherst,
New York, taken pursuant to Subpoena, connecting to
various locations on October 7, 2024, commencing at
12:02 p.m., before KELLY K. FRICANO, Notary Public.

12:03:31 1 there, that you answer my question and then we take
12:03:34 2 a break, okay?

12:03:34 3 A. Yes.

12:03:35 4 Q. Okay. Great. So [REDACTED] you are
12:03:39 5 appearing at this deposition pursuant to a subpoena
12:03:43 6 that was issued on you, correct?

12:03:45 7 A. Yes.

12:03:45 8 Q. Okay. So I'm just going to quickly
12:03:48 9 share with you my screen. I have -- I don't have
12:03:57 10 many exhibits today, but I do want to make sure
12:04:04 11 we're on the same page.

12:04:05 12 So can you see something on the screen
12:04:09 13 besides the squares with all the attendees?

12:04:14 14 A. Yes.

12:04:15 15 Q. Okay. Do you see a subpoena in front
12:04:17 16 of you?

12:04:17 17 A. Yes.

18 **The following was marked for Identification:**

19 **EXH. 1 Subpoena.**

12:04:18 20 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:04:18 21 Q. Okay. Great. I'm happy to scroll down
12:04:23 22 to the bottom to show you the entirety of the
12:04:26 23 document. Is this the subpoena that was issued to

12:04:33 1 you calling for your attendance at today's
12:04:35 2 deposition?

12:04:35 3 A. Yes, ma'am.

12:04:36 4 Q. Okay. Great. So [REDACTED] was there
12:04:43 5 a time when you attended Canisius College as an
12:04:48 6 undergraduate student?

12:04:50 7 A. Yes, ma'am.

12:04:51 8 Q. And When was that?

12:04:52 9 A. 2010. I believe I transferred from
12:05:02 10 another college in 2010. It could --

12:05:03 11 Q. Okay. And -- go ahead, I'm sorry. I
12:05:09 12 don't want to cut you off.

12:05:09 13 A. It could have been 2011. I'm pretty
12:05:14 14 sure it was 2010.

12:05:15 15 Q. Okay. Was there a specific reason why
12:05:19 16 you transferred to Canisius?

12:05:23 17 A. Yes, I had learned of the ABEC Program
12:05:29 18 and I had done a tour with Dr. Michael Noonan where
12:05:36 19 he encouraged me to become a part of his personal
12:05:41 20 research team and I was very exited about the
12:05:45 21 prospects of actually specifically not having to
12:05:54 22 experiment with animals.

12:05:56 23 He promised me that that would not be part

12:05:59 1 of the curriculum and I chose to transfer from my
12:06:07 2 current college at that time to Canisius because of
12:06:12 3 that assurance.

12:06:20 4 So that was what really drew me in. It
12:06:23 5 was I was going to be able to work with and for
12:06:26 6 animals and not have to harm them, so he said.

12:06:30 7 Q. Were you -- what were your goals in
12:06:35 8 attending the ABEC Program at Canisius, what were
12:06:39 9 your professional goals?

12:06:41 10 A. I wanted to continue --

12:06:43 11 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry.

13 MS. NAASSANA: It's fine. You can answer.

14 I just wanted to document my form objection. Thank
12:06:44 15 you.

12:06:44 16 THE WITNESS: I wanted to eventually get a
12:06:57 17 PhD and be able to work as someone in --
12:07:04 18 specifically for animals who are going to be killed
12:07:09 19 because of their behavior. So I was doing animal
12:07:13 20 behavior with a dog trainer and she would take
12:07:20 21 cases that, you know, these animals were going to
12:07:23 22 be put to sleep and so I would -- I wanted to get
12:07:25 23 the maximum education possible so that I could be a

12:07:30 1 foreperson on the -- in the field, field -- in the
12:07:39 2 field. And --

12:07:39 3 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:07:40 4 **Q.** And do you -- I'm sorry, go ahead.

12:07:43 5 **A.** I mean, there's also like -- there's
12:07:46 6 really no telling how many different ways I could
12:07:51 7 have gone with that. I just intended to do the
12:07:56 8 ABEC and then a masters and then a doctorate. That
12:07:58 9 was my -- that was my intention and I wanted to
12:08:01 10 help animals.

12:08:03 11 I was into animal liberation. So I think I
12:08:07 12 would have been able to apply that in so many
12:08:11 13 different ways, a PhD. But that was my goal.

12:08:14 14 **Q.** And prior to matriculating at Canisius
12:08:18 15 as a student, did you discuss those goals with
12:08:22 16 anyone at Canisius?

12:08:23 17 **A.** Yes, I spoke directly with Michael
12:08:27 18 Noonan and he was very enthusiastic in, again,
12:08:35 19 assuring me that this was the right place for me,
12:08:37 20 to come to Canisius from my previous college and,
12:08:40 21 you know, really selling it to me. So I was very
12:08:46 22 excited. I did only talk to Dr. Noonan before
12:08:50 23 transferring.

12:11:49 1 early 20s, early to mid 20s, so I wasn't fresh out
12:11:53 2 of high school like most of the young women in his
12:11:57 3 class.

12:11:57 4 So I was kind of sitting back observing this
12:12:01 5 and kind of like shocked, but I didn't say
12:12:05 6 anything, but he was right off the bat, first day,
12:12:09 7 he was talking about kissing his students and how
12:12:13 8 that was totally fine and how he would take them on
12:12:17 9 trips and all the fun things that they would do but
12:12:21 10 that, you know, they would be a part of his -- like
12:12:26 11 real intimate and it was just very strange to me.

12:12:31 12 Like that was right off -- that was like day
12:12:32 13 one. And so that in conjunction with not having my
12:12:40 14 learning accommodations observed, I just really
12:12:45 15 struggled.

12:12:46 16 I had gone from like a 4.0 at my other
17 college and tutoring -- calculus tutoring,
12:12:54 18 chemistry -- I mean, I was excelling, to his
12:12:57 19 program, which was in my estimation, completely
12:13:01 20 impossible to get an A in his class unless you were
12:13:05 21 one of his chosen ones.

12:13:07 22 So it was just like real memorization and
12:13:12 23 just -- I think it was -- the first test we had, I

12:13:21 1 remember he had us choose like an extra credit --
12:13:26 2 like for extra credit we could -- we had to choose
12:13:29 3 if you had a group of elephants, they were on like
12:13:37 4 a reserve. He said that the extra credit was you
12:13:43 5 had to choose that the population of those
12:13:45 6 elephants was too much, that that reserve could not
12:13:50 7 handle all the elephants, so you had to choose,
12:13:53 8 would you kill an entire family group of elephants
12:13:58 9 or would you kill one elephant from each of the
12:14:02 10 family groups on the reserve and I refused to
12:14:05 11 answer that and that kind of like marked me right
12:14:09 12 off the bat as somebody who wasn't going to play
12:14:15 13 his game.

12:14:16 14 Q. With regard to that -- what Dr. Noonan
12:14:24 15 said during the first day of class which you
12:14:28 16 referred to that he would kiss students, do you
12:14:31 17 remember the context of those comments?

12:14:34 18 A. He -- okay. He said that it happened
12:14:39 19 on -- he was telling us about the trips that he
12:14:43 20 would take with his research team and that one of
12:14:48 21 the girls on his research team, he kissed on the
12:14:51 22 mouth and that he said that that was normal and
12:14:56 23 that -- you know, he said it, I don't know why he

12:14:58 1 would say it.

12:14:59 2 Now I understand it was just kind of, in my
12:15:02 3 estimation, a way of putting something out there
12:15:05 4 and seeing how people would respond to it. No one
12:15:09 5 responded to it.

12:15:11 6 So I just remember it was the first day of
12:15:14 7 class and he was just telling us like how it would
12:15:17 8 be on a trip and it was just really disjointed from
12:15:22 9 the rest of the conversations which was all about
12:15:24 10 animals. But he would -- he made sure to tell us
12:15:29 11 how it was appropriate that he kissed a student
12:15:32 12 once.

12:15:33 13 I don't know. It made no sense to me why he
12:15:36 14 would say that. It was -- really stood out to me
12:15:40 15 as strange, but no one else seemed to bat an eye.

12:15:45 16 Q. Aside from that first day which you've
12:15:50 17 recounted for us already, did you observe
12:15:54 18 Dr. Noonan engage in any other conduct that you
19 thought was inappropriate during the Social Org
12:16:00 20 class or the lab?

12:16:02 21 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:16:04 22 MS. NANAU: You can answer, [REDACTED]

12:16:06 23 THE WITNESS: He would regularly be touching

1 his female student's hair, taking their hair out of
2 whatever they had come to class with their hair
3 style in, coming behind them and taking it out and
4 then, you know, running his hands through their
5 hair and braiding it for them and redoing it the
6 way he liked. And often times he would do it in
7 really silly ways as a -- it was very humiliating
8 the ways that he would make their hair look.

9 But he was always -- I mean, I don't
10 exaggerate, it was every day I would see him
11 touching his student's hair, the females, the days
12 that I would have his class which I believe was two
13 or three times a week. And the one time, I -- you
14 know, he would do this to me as well, he did this
15 to me.

16 And then, also, this was on the bus, we were
17 going to Pittsburgh Zoo and I was sitting across
18 from my friend [REDACTED] [phonetic],
19 who is now like a PhD candidate and doing great as
20 a primatologist. But she -- originally she
21 couldn't stand Noonan, but she ended up on this bus
22 trip, she's sitting across from me in the seat in
23 the school bus and Noonan comes down the hallway,

12:17:45 1 like the walkway in the middle [REDACTED] the seats
12:17:49 2 and he stands over -- she was -- I think she was
12:17:54 3 laying down in the seat with her legs in the aisle.

12:17:59 4 Yes, she was sitting -- she was sitting --
12:18:03 5 she was definitely laying down with her legs in the
12:18:06 6 aisle and he walked over to her and I and he took
12:18:11 7 her legs and he put them up over her head. Like I
12:18:20 8 can't -- I was just like shocked, and he stood
12:18:24 9 there in like a clear sexual position. It was just
12:18:29 10 unreal and I don't think she like allowed him to do
12:18:31 11 that for very long, maybe like five or ten seconds.
12:18:36 12 But I mean, that was shocking to me.

12:18:40 13 The things that -- the things that he would
12:18:43 14 get away with, I think were just always so shocking
12:18:49 15 and appalling to me and I think it was because his
12:18:54 16 students were so young. The young women didn't
12:18:58 17 know any better or thought that like they were
12:19:01 18 excited to be his chosen ones so they would let him
12:19:06 19 do this stuff sometimes. I mean, that's what I
12:19:06 20 observed.

12:19:06 21 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:19:06 22 **Q.** Is there -- so aside from, you know,
12:19:12 23 the braiding hair, the comment about kissing the

12:19:18 1 student, simulated sex with [REDACTED] is there
12:19:25 2 anything else that stands out regarding
12:19:27 3 Dr. Noonan's conduct, either during the Social Org
12:19:30 4 class or the lab that you can recall?

12:19:35 5 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

12:19:38 6 **THE WITNESS:** By standing -- by standing --
12:19:39 7 anything that stood out to me, if you're talking
12:19:42 8 about like physical contact?

12:19:44 9 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:19:44 10 **Q.** Physical contact or comments.

12:19:46 11 **A.** Oh, okay.

12:19:49 12 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

12:19:50 13 **THE WITNESS:** So comments, I can certainly
12:19:56 14 tell you that there was a constant influx of really
12:20:02 15 disturbing comments and just his way about being in
12:20:09 16 control of the students. In the lab, we were
12:20:15 17 forced to -- despite his assurances that I would
12:20:19 18 not have to experiment on animals or partake in any
12:20:27 19 kind of harm to animals if I transferred, I would
12:20:30 20 actually be required as a part of his Social
12:20:31 21 Organization of Mammals course to observe and
12:20:33 22 partake in the daily abuse and torture of a colony
12:20:40 23 of rats.

12:20:41 1 He said that it was a Jane Goodall
12:20:46 2 experience and that anybody who was a part of this
12:20:49 3 lab was lucky because he said that there were grad
12:20:54 4 students who would wish that they could have an
12:21:00 5 opportunity to be part of this Jane Goodall
12:21:04 6 experience, which was a steel cage where eight
12:21:08 7 female rats and eight male rats were put in to --
12:21:12 8 with nowhere to escape to.

12:21:15 9 All the females who could naturally like
12:21:19 10 escape in nature were, you know, cornered and -- I
12:21:23 11 mean, they were clearly being raped. And then when
12:21:28 12 they started giving birth, the babies would be
12:21:33 13 eaten alive. Every morning we'd come in and they
12:21:39 14 would be cleaning off the blood and the guts and
12:21:42 15 the legs and the arm from the steel.

12:21:46 16 And when I would complain and say, you know,
12:21:48 17 somebody -- like one particular animal was being
12:21:53 18 picked on and I would call him and I would try to
12:21:55 19 get him to come and help this animal because it was
12:21:59 20 not natural, what we were witnessing. These
12:22:03 21 animals in nature would be able to run away from
12:22:08 22 the colony or find another colony to live with or
12:22:11 23 they -- I'm not sure what would happen, right, but

12:22:14 1 it wasn't going -- it wasn't going to be like this
12:22:18 2 torturous experience.

12:22:18 3 So he would make me wait for like three
12:22:22 4 hours where I was only -- I was only required to
12:22:25 5 spend an hour a day sitting and observing the
12:22:28 6 torture of the animals, but because I wanted him to
12:22:33 7 come and help the animals who were acutely
12:22:36 8 suffering under my observation, he would have me
12:22:40 9 wait and I would have to watch that for like three
12:22:44 10 hours while he took his time coming down.

12:22:47 11 And then his suggestion -- solution would be
12:22:50 12 that he would just take them out in front of me and
12:22:54 13 break their necks, which I of course said, no, no,
12:22:58 14 don't do that. So they would just stay and remain
12:23:01 15 being attacked and it was just terrible.

12:23:06 16 I would take pictures of the animals -- I
12:23:09 17 would take pictures of the animals' injuries and he
12:23:15 18 would try -- he would try to get me to delete the
12:23:20 19 pictures on my phone and make me go through and
12:23:25 20 delete -- and actually, yeah, that's what -- sorry.
12:23:26 21 I completely forgot, but that's when he -- I took a
12:23:31 22 picture of him standing over [REDACTED] on the
12:23:37 23 bus with her legs up over her head.

12:29:06 1 captivity and it was big news all over the world, I
12:29:10 2 think, and he was called to comment on it and he
12:29:13 3 refused and he was like -- he told us, yeah, they
12:29:17 4 called me and I told them no.

12:29:20 5 So he was just not -- he was not ever there
12:29:22 6 to help the animals. It was always the animals
12:29:26 7 were there as a means to him. And his persona as a
12:29:33 8 researcher, he just exploited every animal and
12:29:39 9 human and non-human and human alike in his mitts to
12:29:45 10 get what it was that he wanted. That's my personal
12:29:50 11 perspective.

12:29:50 12 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:29:50 13 **Q.** [REDACTED] with regard to the
12:29:52 14 treatment of the rats during the Social Org lab,
12:29:57 15 did you ever discuss your concerns with a faculty
12:30:02 16 member at Canisius or an administrator?

12:30:06 17 **A.** Yes, I would share my feelings about
12:30:11 18 the rat torture. I talked at length to
12:30:20 19 Dr. Margulis, who was his right hand man. I mean,
12:30:24 20 she was just no better than he, but like she -- I
12:30:30 21 felt she was intimidated by him and I just wanted
12:30:34 22 somebody to help.

12:30:35 23 So I would try to reach out to her and have

12:30:38 1 her come and help the animals and she would
12:30:44 2 just -- she was -- acted completely, whatever the
12:30:51 3 word is. I can't recall -- I can't remember what
12:30:55 4 word I'm trying to use, but basically --
12:30:58 5 inadequate. She couldn't do anything about it.
12:31:00 6 She was just so meek, it was pathetic.

12:31:04 7 Q. Anyone other than Dr. Margulis that you
12:31:09 8 raised your concerns about Dr. Noonan's treatment
12:31:13 9 of the rats during the Social Org lab?

12:31:16 10 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:31:17 11 THE WITNESS: I reached out to the college
12:31:20 12 newspaper and they did an investigation of some
12:31:23 13 manner. They did an article where they interviewed
12:31:31 14 me, they tried to interview Noonan about the rat
12:31:32 15 torture and I believe that was published in one of
12:31:36 16 the newspapers. I can't -- I can't remember
12:31:38 17 exactly.

12:31:40 18 I -- no, I think it was a video. They
12:31:43 19 did -- there may have been a written component,
12:31:46 20 like a written article, but it was actually a
12:31:50 21 video. It was a video -- what's it called -- a
12:31:57 22 video by the reporter.

12:32:00 23 And he showed like the laboratory where it

12:32:04 1 happened. He couldn't get into the lab, but I took
12:32:07 2 him up and showed him where it -- where the
12:32:11 3 laboratory was on the third floor of the science
12:32:16 4 complex and yeah.

12:32:20 5 And then also, so -- so I mean everybody on
12:32:25 6 the campus became aware after that, you know,
12:32:29 7 anybody who had seen that video that was made by
12:32:32 8 the newspaper team for the college, everybody was
12:32:38 9 aware of what was going on.

12:32:40 10 And I know I had mentioned the Social Org
12:32:47 11 class with the rat situation. I made like a
12:32:52 12 Facebook page about it so people would have known
12:32:55 13 through that. And then also, I think I -- I
12:32:57 14 definitely mentioned just the torture of the
12:33:01 15 animals and the way that he was so proud of hurting
12:33:05 16 animals and desensitizing students.

12:33:08 17 I know I told that to the Dean of Students,
12:33:13 18 doctor -- gosh, I can't remember her name right
12:33:18 19 now. Shit. But, yeah.

12:33:20 20 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:33:20 21 **Q.** Was it Dr. Erickson who you spoke to?

12:33:24 22 **A.** No, I don't think so. That
12:33:27 23 doesn't -- that could have been -- that could have

12:33:30 1 been the man that I talked to. I talked to a man
12:33:34 2 once and then I talked to -- after my arrest at the
12:33:36 3 college, I also spoke to a woman dean.

12:33:41 4 Q. Pat Erickson, I believe, was a woman.

12:33:45 5 A. Oh, is it?

12:33:46 6 Q. Yeah.

12:33:47 7 A. Yeah, that wasn't the name of the woman
12:33:49 8 that I met with, I don't -- I don't believe. I
12:33:53 9 mean it wasn't. I can't remember her name right
12:33:55 10 now.

12:33:57 11 Q. Did anything come of the newspaper
12:34:00 12 article regarding the poor treatment of the rats in
12:34:06 13 the Social Org lab; do you know?

12:34:07 14 A. Yeah, the -- because of the amount of
12:34:11 15 pressure I put on him, he did discontinue that
12:34:17 16 experiment after 30 years of doing it every other
12:34:20 17 semester. He just, he stopped doing it.

12:34:25 18 Q. Did there come a time when you
12:34:28 19 complained to any faculty member or Canisius
12:34:33 20 administrator about Dr. Noonan's claim that he
12:34:36 21 kissed a woman student on the mouth or his
12:34:40 22 treatment of Allie Hoffner during the trip to the
12:34:46 23 Pittsburgh Zoo?

12:34:48 1 **A.** Yes, I recall mentioning that to the
12:34:51 2 woman dean when -- after my arrest, they were going
12:34:58 3 to be doing an investigation to see if they wanted
12:35:02 4 to pursue further -- I don't know, like just to see
12:35:05 5 what happened on that date.

12:35:06 6 And that was -- I definitely told them then.
12:35:11 7 I told them in like -- that was probably 2011, and
12:35:16 8 I told them months prior -- or no, I'm sorry.
12:35:22 9 Months after I stopped being in his program at all,
12:35:26 10 so that would have been like 20 -- late 2011 or
12:35:32 11 2012, if I was still at that school.

12:35:34 12 I was not there for very long. Maybe like a
12:35:37 13 year or two. But yeah, I told two different -- two
12:35:42 14 different school officials and both of them, I
12:35:43 15 believe, were deans. One was a male and one was a
12:35:46 16 female.

12:35:46 17 **Q.** And do you remember what specifically
12:35:48 18 you told them about Noonan's comments about kissing
12:35:52 19 a student or his treatment of [REDACTED] during
12:35:56 20 that school trip?

12:35:57 21 **A.** Yeah, I just told him like that there
12:36:01 22 were -- I said that they were worried about the
12:36:01 23 wrong things when they were reprimanding me for

12:36:06 1 taking a pencil and writing on a piece of paper
12:36:10 2 that was taped to the wall, like giving directions
12:36:15 3 to where Dr. Noonan was having some talk and it had
12:36:19 4 an arrow and it said, Dr. Noonan this way. I just
12:36:23 5 wrote in pencil, in parentheses, fossil, like that
6 he was a fossil.

12:36:30 7 And then, you know, they saw me on the
12:36:33 8 camera and brought me into to -- to the Dean's
12:36:38 9 office, this is when I was talking to the male
12:36:41 10 dean, and I just remember saying, you're really
12:36:45 11 concerned about the wrong thing.

12:36:48 12 You know, like how many times have you been
12:36:50 13 warned about this man because at that time I had
12:36:54 14 become aware that other professors had complained
12:37:01 15 about him, about him physically pushing them up
12:37:03 16 against walls and trying to intimidate and yell at
12:37:07 17 them. So I was like real surprised that they would
12:37:13 18 have the audacity to bring me in for writing on a
12:37:14 19 piece of paper with pencil.

12:37:14 20 Q. Do you recall when that happened, was
12:37:17 21 it the same semester when you were in the Social
12:37:21 22 Org class or lab with Dr. Noonan or was that after?

12:37:25 23 A. Yeah, this was all after. I didn't

12:37:29 1 have any conversations with anybody other than
12:37:35 2 Dr. Margulis and the -- there was also a
12:37:39 3 Dr. Putnam, Susan Putnam. I believe she was in
12:37:44 4 biology. She used to have to work directly with
12:37:48 5 Noonan until he was given his own entire program,
12:37:51 6 when she had had terrible experiences with him as
7 well.

12:37:55 8 So I talked to Dr. Putnam, Dr. Susan Putnam,
12:37:59 9 and I talked to Dr. Margulis when I was actually in
12:38:02 10 his Social Org class and then when I decided to
12:38:07 11 leave his program and go into the philosophy
12:38:10 12 program, then I started to talk to many other
12:38:14 13 different professors. In the philosophy department
12:38:16 14 I would talk about him all the time.

12:38:18 15 And then, the two deans and that was after I
12:38:23 16 talked to these different deans, after I left the
12:38:28 17 program -- his program and went into philosophy.

12:38:32 18 Q. With regarding to Dr. Putnam, did she
12:38:36 19 tell you what terrible experiences she had with
12:38:40 20 Noonan?

12:38:40 21 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:38:44 22 THE WITNESS: She would not elaborate. She
12:38:50 23 said that she was witness to him being

12:38:54 1 inappropriate with students and physically
12:39:03 2 aggressive towards a male student.

12:39:08 3 But that, you know, she wouldn't tell me
12:39:11 4 what exactly happened, though. But she just said
12:39:15 5 that she was -- she had to work with him for a long
12:39:20 6 period of time and then they just ended up giving
12:39:23 7 him his own program where he could just run -- run
12:39:27 8 wild.

12:39:28 9 BY MS. NANAU:

12:39:28 10 Q. With regard to the complaints you were
12:39:31 11 aware of Noonan physically pushing people and
12:39:37 12 yelling at them, what is the source of that
12:39:40 13 information?

12:39:41 14 A. I don't know that he pushed anybody.
12:39:44 15 Like he -- like his physical presence, like he was
12:39:50 16 yelling at doctor -- she's a philosophy professor,
12:39:56 17 oh, my goodness, oh, Lordy.

12:39:59 18 She definitely had multiple run-ins with
12:40:03 19 Noonan and it would have been well documented,
12:40:06 20 so -- about the person I'm talking about. She had
12:40:09 21 made complaints to the school at least a
12:40:12 22 number -- like various occasions, but she said that
12:40:15 23 he was yelling at her and like -- I don't think he

12:40:20 1 pushed her, although, that might have happened, I'm
12:40:23 2 not sure. She said that he had her like pinned up
12:40:27 3 against a wall yelling at her.

12:40:33 4 That was -- oh, my gosh, I cannot
12:40:37 5 believe -- oh, my goodness. I don't know. I think
12:40:41 6 I've just put a lot of this out of my mind.

12:40:44 7 Q. It's no problem. I totally understand.
12:40:45 8 If that name comes to you, you'll --

12:40:47 9 A. She's a tenured philosophy professor
12:40:51 10 there.

12:40:51 11 Q. Okay. Is it Dr. Loughead?

12:40:55 12 A. Yes, that's it. Tanya, Tanya Loughead,
12:41:00 13 yes.

12:41:01 14 Q. Is there any other faculty other than
12:41:04 15 Dr. Loughead and Dr. Putnam who reported to you,
12:41:10 16 either their own experiences or the experiences of
12:41:13 17 others being subjected to misconduct by Dr. Noonan?

18 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:41:20 19 THE WITNESS: Not that I recall.

12:41:22 20 BY MS. NANAU:

12:41:22 21 Q. Okay. You also mentioned during this
12:41:27 22 deposition that you were arrested. Is -- were you
12:41:29 23 arrested at Canisius?

12:41:32 1 A. Yes, ma'am.

12:41:33 2 Q. And can you tell me why you were
12:41:36 3 arrested at Canisius?

12:41:37 4 A. There was a -- okay. There was a
12:41:44 5 speaker event where Dr. James Ha, who's the
12:41:50 6 Director of the National Primate -- some -- some --
12:41:55 7 I can't recall all the details now, but he was a
12:41:59 8 primatologist -- no, that's not correct at all.
9 Hold on.

12:42:02 10 Sorry. He was a breeder of primates for
12:42:09 11 experimentation and he worked out of the University
12:42:11 12 of Washington, I believe, and he was the first
12:42:15 13 speaker that Dr. Noonan organized to have speak to
12:42:21 14 a brand new incoming class.

12:42:22 15 So these kids came from wherever they came
12:42:26 16 from, wanting to become animal behaviorists and
12:42:31 17 help animals and the first thing that he made them
12:42:34 18 do, which is mandatory, was to go to this
12:42:40 19 extracurricular speaker event, which was called a
12:42:41 20 symposium, and listen to this man talk about like,
12:42:47 21 you know, whitewashing, the torture of primates
12:42:50 22 and -- for experimentation.

12:42:53 23 So I -- I had written to Dr. Noonan prior to

12:42:58 1 the event and I just told him, you know, since it's
12:43:03 2 a symposium, it's being advertised as a symposium,
12:43:07 3 that suggests -- you know, since I was in the
12:43:10 4 philosophy program at the time and symposium
12:43:13 5 suggests a myriad of different opinions and ideas.
12:43:19 6 And so I said, I would be happy to organize for an
12:43:24 7 opposing viewpoint to be present at the talk where
12:43:28 8 somebody that I was working with and familiar with
12:43:31 9 within the animal liberation movement, who had --
12:43:35 10 who had worked in laboratories with primates and
12:43:39 11 was a whistleblower, he was happy to come, Michael
12:43:45 12 Budkie, from the group Stop Animal Exploitation
12:43:50 13 Now.

12:43:50 14 And I just was trying to offer to help set
12:43:53 15 that up and he was like, wow, [REDACTED] it hasn't
12:43:58 16 even happened yet and you're already complaining.
12:44:02 17 That's what his e-mail in response to my suggestion
12:44:06 18 said, trying to help him set that up.

12:44:09 19 But he basically said, you know, I invite
12:44:10 20 you to come and just, you know, be open minded or
12:44:14 21 whatever. So he invited me in writing to attend
12:44:18 22 the event.

12:44:20 23 I -- you know, I was organizing a protest

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building

Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

12:44:26 1 prior to the event, which was on public property
12:44:28 2 where we, you know, did nothing out of the
12:44:32 3 ordinary. We had some like theatrical stuff where
12:44:39 4 we had, you know, people dressed up as primates in
12:44:41 5 cages and people dressed up as lab workers and we
12:44:50 6 just, you know, raising awareness about what's
12:44:50 7 going on inside the lab.

12:44:52 8 That ended when this talk began. We shut
12:44:56 9 down the demonstration and some of the protesters
12:44:59 10 turned into attendees to went in to listen to the
12:45:03 11 talk and we listened. I was part of that, I
12:45:06 12 listened to the talk. It was like an hour and a
12:45:08 13 half or whatever and didn't interrupt anything and
12:45:12 14 there was a question and answer session and I asked
12:45:17 15 a question about the, you know, millions of dollars
12:45:21 16 that go from tax payer money into, you know -- from
12:45:27 17 the NIH to these facilities that breed animals and
12:45:33 18 experiment on animals.

12:45:35 19 And I just said, you know, as a tax payer,
12:45:39 20 we'd like to believe that our money is being well
12:45:43 21 spent, but how can we trust you with our hard
12:45:48 22 earned money when you can't even remember to feed
12:45:51 23 your animals and I then procured, you know, the

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building

Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

12:45:56 1 USDA violations in printed form, showing the
12:46:00 2 multiple USDA violations where animals had lost
12:46:02 3 upwards of 30% of their body weight before they
12:46:07 4 died. And you know, these pristine labs where
12:46:12 5 Dr. Ha worked and so he was the best person to
12:46:15 6 answer that question.

12:46:16 7 He didn't -- you know, he didn't look like
12:46:19 8 he wanted to answer the question, was kind of
12:46:22 9 surprised by my question, but he was interrupted
12:46:27 10 from answering by Dr. Noonan who said, James or
12:46:31 11 Jim, you don't need to answer that, you know, he's
12:46:34 12 trying to interject himself -- Dr. Noonan is trying
12:46:37 13 to interject himself. And he said I'm the mediator
12:46:41 14 and I said this doesn't require your mediation,
12:46:44 15 he's happy to answer the question.

12:46:47 16 And he just would not let Dr. Ha speak and
12:46:50 17 then when Dr. Ha said, no, I got this Mike, he
12:46:56 18 said -- and he was answering and -- I'm trying to
12:47:07 19 think how exactly it went down.

12:47:10 20 But basically -- oh, I -- I said, okay. I
12:47:14 21 remember. So Dr. Noonan kept interrupting him and
12:47:18 22 then I said, well, it's clear that you're not going
12:47:22 23 to let him answer the question, so I turned, you

12:47:26 1 know, kind of more towards the audience and I said,
12:47:29 2 if anybody would like to hear the other side of
12:47:33 3 things that's being denied to you here today, I
12:47:37 4 have set up an event with Michael Budkie, the
12:47:43 5 director of Stop Animal Exploitation Now, SAEN, and
12:47:46 6 he will be coming to campus on -- and then they cut
12:47:50 7 my microphone and I kept talking.

12:47:53 8 And then the next thing you know, I've got
12:47:56 9 like two officers grabbing me and dragging me out
12:48:01 10 of the auditorium and everybody's like, (audible
12:48:05 11 gasp), like I have a sound -- like an audio
12:48:09 12 recording of this happening and it's like everybody
12:48:13 13 like as soon as they grabbed me, you can hear
12:48:16 14 everybody in the audience go (audible gasp) like
12:48:20 15 that. It was like this huge committal gasp of
12:48:23 16 shock that somebody was just asking a question, was
12:48:26 17 forcibly removed and I just said, you know, I --
12:48:29 18 while they're dragging me out.

12:48:32 19 They were so forceful that like my shirt
12:48:37 20 came off a little bit, I had a tank top on and my
12:48:42 21 bra was showing. They threw me up against the wall
12:48:49 22 in the vestibule, which is like the entrance to the
12:48:50 23 place -- the auditorium, and they -- I just kept

12:48:57 1 repeating, I'm not resisting, I'm not resisting.

12:49:00 2 They were just manhandling me.

12:49:02 3 It was crazy. They handcuffed me. They're
12:49:06 4 just a really, really, brute force these two
12:49:13 5 grown-ass men with guns, and --

12:49:13 6 Q. [REDACTED] can I just interject, were
12:49:16 7 the two individuals who were removing you from the
12:49:19 8 symposium, were they Canisius security or were they
12:49:22 9 police from Buffalo; do you know?

12:49:24 10 A. Yeah, they were public safety officers,
12:49:27 11 but they were also employed by -- I believe, they
12:49:30 12 were also employed by the police department.

12:49:36 13 Well, that was a point of contention in my
12:49:41 14 lawsuit against Canisius. But basically, they were
12:49:45 15 public safety officers for Canisius, but they were
12:49:48 16 working under the color of law because they -- you
12:49:51 17 know, they're talking to the Buffalo Police
12:49:55 18 Department trying to organize where I would be
12:49:58 19 taken after my arrest.

12:49:59 20 And people were like, where's Morgan and
12:50:03 21 they like had me somewhere on a side street in the
12:50:08 22 back of the car -- in the back of the patrol car.

12:50:10 23 Nobody knew where I was and they were going

12:50:13 1 to take me down to like Booking or whatever
12:50:18 2 downtown and then they were asking me questions and
12:50:20 3 I said, you know I'm a student and they said, what,
12:50:24 4 you're a student? And I was like, yeah, I'm a
12:50:28 5 student at Canisius, like I was invited to come
12:50:32 6 here and they did not know that.

12:50:35 7 So at that point, the arresting officer got
12:50:39 8 on the phone with somebody and he was standing
12:50:42 9 outside the car and he comes back in the car and
12:50:45 10 he's like, do you -- you want the air conditioning
12:50:50 11 on, are you good? You know, he's just realizing,
12:50:52 12 oh, shit, we have an issue. This isn't just some
12:50:57 13 outside agitator which was obvious that that is
12:51:01 14 what the public safety officers had been made
12:51:03 15 aware, that there was some outside agitator that
12:51:07 16 they had to be on the lookout for, but Noonan
12:51:12 17 forgot to mention I was a student and I was
12:51:16 18 invited.

12:51:17 19 So then, you know, they were just trying to
12:51:20 20 kind of like back up things and just say, you know,
12:51:23 21 just -- they had me -- they had my mother come and
12:51:25 22 get me, even though I was like in my mid 20s, I
12:51:29 23 didn't need my mommy to come pick me up.

12:51:34 1 They had a conversation with her and they
12:51:36 2 said we'll release her -- we'll release your
12:51:37 3 daughter to you if you promise not to sue us. And
12:51:44 4 like, my mom's an attorney and so that was like
12:51:45 5 laughable. And she's like, well, you know, she
12:51:47 6 can't make agreements for me, you know, and she
12:51:50 7 said, no, we're not agreeing to anything.

12:51:53 8 So she came and got me and they let me go
12:51:56 9 and they said, well, before you leave, could you --
12:51:58 10 would you be willing to sign this saying that
12:52:01 11 you're -- you know, we've gone through this and
12:52:04 12 everything is okay and you're not, you know, you're
12:52:06 13 not unhappy with how things went or some weird
12:52:10 14 crazy shit like that. And me and her were just
12:52:14 15 like, no, we're not signing anything, we're going
16 home.

12:52:18 17 And I came back like a day later to have my
12:52:22 18 bruises photographed and to write a complaint about
12:52:28 19 my treatment and they said that there were no
12:52:32 20 complaint forms, that they had all been used by
12:52:35 21 other people from that evening who witnessed my
12:52:40 22 treatment. There were, I know, a number of people
12:52:43 23 that did take out complaints. But you know, it

1 shouldn't have been difficult to print out a blank
2 form.

12:52:50 3 And then I said, well, now that I'm here, I
12:52:53 4 need somebody to take photographs with your camera
12:52:56 5 of my bruises, so I made sure that they did that.

12:53:01 6 Q. Let me ask you a question, who was the
12:53:04 7 person who released you to your mother the day of
12:53:09 8 the symposium who said we'll release her if you
12:53:13 9 promise not to sue us, was that a Canisius
12:53:17 10 employee?

12:53:17 11 A. Yeah, there was the director of public
12:53:21 12 safety. He was actually at dinner, I think he was
12:53:24 13 at like Olive Garden or something with his wife for
12:53:24 14 their anniversary. I don't know. Maybe it wasn't
12:53:25 15 Olive Garden. I just remember it was some
12:53:27 16 restaurant for his anniversary with his wife and
12:53:31 17 they called him to the school to handle this
12:53:35 18 situation.

12:53:36 19 So he talked to my mother on the phone
12:53:41 20 before I think he even got to the college himself.
12:53:44 21 He was talking to my mom on the phone trying to get
12:53:48 22 a feel for what the situation was going to be. But
12:53:53 23 yeah, it was the director of public safety.

12:53:56 1 Q. And was it -- who was -- who -- what
12:53:59 2 office did you go to the next day to request that
12:54:03 3 your bruises were photographed and then you were
12:54:05 4 told there are no more complaint forms?

12:54:10 5 A. The Public Safety Office.

12:54:13 6 Q. So did there come a time, ultimately,
12:54:16 7 when public safety or someone else at Canisius took
12:54:20 8 pictures of the bruises?

12:54:23 9 A. Yes, they did take -- the officer that
12:54:25 10 was on staff there the day that I came to file my
12:54:30 11 complaint did -- he went and got a camera and he
12:54:34 12 had me come into the back room and took pictures of
12:54:38 13 my bruises that very day.

12:54:39 14 Q. And were you permitted ultimately to
12:54:42 15 submit a complaint to the Public Safety Office
12:54:45 16 regarding this incident at the symposium?

12:54:48 17 A. No, I don't believe so.

12:54:50 18 Q. So you mentioned a lawsuit. Did there
12:54:52 19 come a time when you sued Canisius College
12:54:54 20 regarding the mistreatment you were subjected to
12:54:58 21 during the symposium with Dr. Ha and Dr. Noonan?

12:55:04 22 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:55:05 23 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

1 BY MS. NANAU:

12:55:08 2 Q. And when was that, [REDACTED]; do you
3 recall?

12:55:11 4 A. I think it was in 2016. It was
12:55:14 5 after -- I think it was after my son was killed, so
12:55:18 6 that would have been 2016. Yeah, I'm not exactly
12:55:23 7 sure.

12:55:24 8 Q. I'm sorry to hear about your loss.

12:55:27 9 A. Thank you.

12:55:28 10 Q. Was that lawsuit ultimately resolved?

12:55:32 11 A. Yes.

12:55:34 12 Q. Do you recall the venue where that
12:55:37 13 lawsuit was filed?

12:55:40 14 A. It would have just been the Supreme
12:55:44 15 Court, Erie County District, the civil -- I can't
12:55:52 16 remember what like section it was or anything.

12:55:54 17 Q. Okay. You said that you transferred to
12:55:58 18 the philosophy department at Canisius. Did you
12:56:00 19 transfer to the philosophy department because you
12:56:04 20 did not want to work with Dr. Noonan after you took
12:56:10 21 the Social Org class and the lab?

12:56:12 22 MS. NAASSANA: Form.

12:56:12 23 THE WITNESS: Yes, yes.

12:56:13 1 BY MS. NANAU:

12:56:13 2 Q. Did you obtain your bachelor's degree
12:56:16 3 in philosophy from Canisius?

12:56:19 4 A. Eventually, yes.

12:56:21 5 Q. So you were able to go back to the
12:56:25 6 school and complete your degree?

12:56:28 7 A. Yes.

12:56:29 8 Q. Okay.

12:56:30 9 A. I didn't go back. They let me -- it
12:56:36 10 was very strange because I was never told that I
12:56:39 11 couldn't return to the school. I was never told
12:56:43 12 that I was not allowed on campus or that I was not
12:56:46 13 allowed to take classes.

12:56:49 14 But in the -- in the agreement, they
12:56:56 15 basically said that I could -- I could graduate if
12:57:01 16 I completed, you know, a couple last classes. I
12:57:05 17 would be allowed to graduate, but that I had to
12:57:07 18 take them online and I was not allowed to go to the
12:57:11 19 graduation in-person.

12:57:13 20 Q. So when did you -- when did you obtain
12:57:22 21 your degree from Canisius by completing the classes
12:57:28 22 you had to take online?

12:57:29 23 A. I received my degree in 2020 and it was

12:57:38 1 a very difficult time between the time I left
12:57:41 2 Canisius and the time I got my degree. It was just
12:57:48 3 like terrible, terrible because that was my dream
12:57:53 4 was to be a PhD, it was to be a functional
12:57:59 5 researcher and help -- and just helping animals in
12:58:02 6 the capacity of like the highest level of education
12:58:05 7 you can have. I was just so capable and all of my
12:58:10 8 dreams were just shit all over. Can't really say
12:58:14 9 it in any other way.

12:58:15 10 So I'm glad I ended up getting a bachelor's
12:58:21 11 degree, at least. It was not at all in anything I
12:58:25 12 would have chosen, but philosophy made sense. At
12:58:29 13 least there I could question things and not get
12:58:33 14 arrested.

12:58:33 15 Q. So you filed the lawsuit in 2016 and
12:58:43 16 when did that lawsuit get resolved, do you recall
12:58:48 17 the year? Was it the year that you obtained your
12:58:52 18 bachelor's degree from Canisius?

12:58:54 19 A. I believe it was 2019. I'm not sure,
12:59:00 20 but it was not for some time -- it was for -- yeah,
12:59:07 21 I think it was 2019. The lawsuit went on for a
12:59:11 22 long time.

12:59:12 23 Q. I'm wondering, do you know if Canisius

12:59:19 1 conducted any investigation in response to your --
12:59:25 2 response to the Complaint that you filed in the
12:59:28 3 Supreme Court of Erie County?

12:59:30 4 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

12:59:32 5 **THE WITNESS:** Could you repeat the question?

12:59:35 6 **BY MS. NANAU:**

12:59:36 7 **Q.** Yeah, I guess I'm just wondering if you
12:59:40 8 are aware of any investigation that Canisius
12:59:42 9 conducted into your allegations that were part of
12:59:47 10 your lawsuit against the school in 2016?

12:59:50 11 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

12:59:51 12 **THE WITNESS:** I know that Ms. -- well, I
12:59:55 13 can't remember her name -- Ms. -- I can't recall
12:59:58 14 the dean's name, but the dean who was there when I
13:00:03 15 was arrested, they -- she did conduct some kind of
13:00:08 16 an investigation of my arrest and -- but that was
13:00:13 17 not in response to my lawsuit, that was like at the
13:00:17 18 time that the arrest happened.

13:00:20 19 I would imagine that they -- that -- I mean,
13:00:25 20 I gave them everything they asked for, obviously,
13:00:29 21 in discovery, so that was some kind of
13:00:33 22 investigation. I suppose you could consider that
13:00:34 23 an investigation.

13:00:34 1 **BY MS. NANAU:**

13:00:35 2 **Q.** Did you ever receive either during the
13:00:37 3 time you were at Canisius right after the symposium
13:00:41 4 with Dr. Ha and Dr. Noonan or at any other time,
13:00:46 5 any documentation demonstrating that Dr. Noonan
13:00:49 6 received discipline for his part in, you know, in
13:00:55 7 your arrest at Canisius at the symposium?

13:00:59 8 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

13:01:00 9 **THE WITNESS:** Definitely not.

13:01:09 10 **BY MS. NANAU:**

13:01:10 11 **Q.** Ms. Dunbar, I'm wondering if
13:01:15 12 there -- if we have discussed all of the misconduct
13:01:18 13 that you are aware of that Dr. Noonan has engaged
13:01:23 14 in during his tenure as a faculty member at
13:01:28 15 Canisius, is there anything else that we have not
13:01:32 16 discussed?

13:01:32 17 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

13:01:34 18 **THE WITNESS:** No, I think we've covered
13:01:38 19 everything that I'm aware of. Just that situation
13:01:43 20 where he was physically aggressive towards
13:01:47 21 Dr. Loughead and then Dr. Putnam, she had terrible
13:01:54 22 experiences and then my experiences and then what
13:01:58 23 he admitted to doing with kissing a student. I

13:02:08 1 think that is it.

13:02:08 2 **BY MS. NANAU:**

13:02:08 3 **Q.** With regard to Dr. Loughead being
13:02:11 4 screamed at by Dr. Noonan and physically
13:02:14 5 intimidated by him, did Dr. Loughead tell you about
13:02:20 6 that -- about those experiences with Dr. Noonan
13:02:22 7 herself?

13:02:22 8 **MS. NAASSANA:** Form.

13:02:23 9 **THE WITNESS:** Yes, ma'am, yes.

13:02:25 10 **BY MS. NANAU:**

13:02:25 11 **Q.** Okay. And did Dr. Loughead tell you
13:02:29 12 that she reported Dr. Noonan's misconduct, which
13:02:33 13 she experienced herself, to Canisius'
13:02:36 14 administration?

13:02:37 15 **A.** Yes, ma'am.

13:02:38 16 **Q.** And what about Dr. Putnam, do you know
13:02:43 17 if Dr. Putnam reported the misconduct that she was
13:02:47 18 aware of that Dr. Noonan subjected students to, did
13:02:53 19 she report that to the Canisius' administration?

13:02:55 20 **A.** Yes, she said she did and that their
13:02:59 21 response was to give him his very own program where
13:03:04 22 he could not have to -- not have to have run-ins
13:03:07 23 with his critics.